THE HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF SOUTH AUSTRALIA

Founded 1974

**Objects:**

(a) to arouse interest in and to promote the study and discussion of history, especially South Australian and Australian history.
(b) to promote the collection, preservation and classification of source material of all kinds relating to South Australian and Australian history.
(c) to publish historical records and articles.
(d) to promote the interchange of information among members of the Society by lectures, readings, discussions, field trips and exhibitions.
(e) to co-operate with similar societies throughout Australia.
(f) to do all such things as are conducive or incidental to the attainment of any of the above objects.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>PATRON</strong></th>
<th>His Excellency Rear Admiral Kevin Scarce AC, CSC, RANR Governor of South Australia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>COUNCIL:</strong></td>
<td><strong>May 2012-April 2013</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PRESIDENT:</strong></td>
<td>Dr G. Bishop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>VICE-PRESIDENT:</strong></td>
<td>Dr A. Brown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SECRETARY:</strong></td>
<td>Mr T. Saunderson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TREASURER:</strong></td>
<td>Ms A. Bowman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MEMBERS:</strong></td>
<td>Ms M. Ford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dr B. Whimpress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr C. Deed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ms M. Cliff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ms M. Lucas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mrs M. Young</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ms P. Sumerling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>JOURNAL EDITOR:</strong></td>
<td>Dr B. Dickey (for 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EDITORIAL COMMITTEE:</strong></td>
<td>Dr C. Garnaut</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr R.M. Gibbs, AM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dr D.L. Hilliard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dr. P. Monteath</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr B. Samuels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NEWSLETTER EDITOR:</strong></td>
<td>Mr R. Martin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONSULTANTS:</strong></td>
<td>Mr R.M. Gibbs, AM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr B. Samuels</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A list of past Presidents may be found on the Society’s website, www.hssa.org.au
Table of Contents

President’s Report 2013.............................................................................................................................................. 5

The Debate on the Commonwealth Takeover of the Northern Territory, 1910

Bob Reece................................................................................................................................................................. 8

Catherine Helen Spence’s Journalism: Some Social Aspects of South Australian Life, by A Colonist of 1839 –
C.H. Spence

Susan Magarey .......................................................................................................................................................... 22

St Patrick’s Church, Grote Street, Adelaide: a short history

David Hilliard .............................................................................................................................................................. 30

Architecture: an expression of German culture

Lothar Brasse................................................................................................................................................................. 45

Italian Civilian Internment in South Australia Revisited

Mia Spizzica .................................................................................................................................................................. 65

The Sym Choons of Rundle Street

Patricia Sumerling ........................................................................................................................................................ 80

Erhard Eylmann in South Australia

Peter Monteath .............................................................................................................................................................. 89

Book Reviews ................................................................................................................................................................. 104

Notes on contributors ..................................................................................................................................................... 123

Publications of the Historical Society of South Australia ......................................................................................... 124
Editor’s Note

The *Journal of the Historical Society of South Australia* accepts contributions on historical subjects relating to South Australia or Australia. These may take the form of research articles, conference addresses, short research notes, photographic essays or occasional pieces. Book reviews are commissioned by the Editor. Correspondence for 2014 should be directed to the Editor, Dr Peter Monteath, School of International Studies, Flinders University, GPO Box 2100, Adelaide, 5001, or forwarded by e-mail to peter.monteath@flinders.edu.au

Articles submitted for academic assessment are refereed, but the final decision on publication rests with the Editor.

The articles in the *Journal of the Historical Society of South Australia*, Number 41, 2013 have been peer reviewed by two referees. Since the first issue in 1975 all essays have been indexed in the Australian Public Affairs Information Service (APAIS). Full texts (1995+) are available online via APA Full Text.

The cover montage is compiled from images supplied by authors represented in the *Journal of the Historical Society of South Australia*, Number 41, 2013. and includes the image of the painting by Hans Heysen, ‘At Friedrichstadt, near Hahndorf’ (1897-98. Oil on board). (Courtesy Art Gallery of South Australia)

The Historical Society of South Australia gratefully acknowledges the assistance of the peer reviewers.

Published by the Historical Society of South Australia, P.O. Box 519, Kent Town, SA 5071.
www.hssa.org.au

Printed by Solitio Fine Colour Printers, 301-305 Wright St, Adelaide, SA 5000.

**Copyright:** Individual authors retain copyright of their material published in the *Journal of the Historical Society of South Australia*. Apart from any fair dealing under the *Copyright Act*, no part of the *Journal* may be reproduced without written permission. Enquiries should be directed to the HSSA Secretary.

ISSN 0312-9640
Editor's Note

The Journal of the Historical Society of South Australia accepts contributions on historical subjects relating to South Australia or Australia. These may take the form of research articles, conference addresses, short research notes, photographic essays or occasional pieces. Book reviews are commissioned by the Editor. Correspondence for 2014 should be directed to the Editor, Dr Peter Monteath, School of International Studies, Flinders University, GPO Box 2100, Adelaide, 5001, or forwarded by e-mail to peter.monteath@flinders.edu.au

Articles submitted for academic assessment are refereed, but the final decision on publication rests with the Editor.

The articles in the Journal of the Historical Society of South Australia, Number 41, 2013 have been peer reviewed by two referees. Since the first issue in 1975 all essays have been indexed in the Australian Public Affairs Information Service (APAIS). Full texts (1995+) are available online via APA Full Text.

The cover montage is compiled from images supplied by authors represented in the Journal of the Historical Society of South Australia, Number 41, 2013. and includes the image of the painting by Hans Heysen, 'At Friedrichstadt, near Hahndorf' (1897-98. Oil on board). (Courtesy Art Gallery of South Australia)

The Historical Society of South Australia gratefully acknowledges the assistance of the peer reviewers.

Published by the Historical Society of South Australia, P.O. Box 519, Kent Town, SA 5071.

www.hssa.org.au

Printed by Solitio Fine Colour Printers, 301-305 Wright St, Adelaide, SA 5000.

Copyright: Individual authors retain copyright of their material published in the Journal of the Historical Society of South Australia. Apart from any fair dealing under the Copyright Act, no part of the Journal may be reproduced without written permission. Enquiries should be directed to the HSSA Secretary.

ISSN 0312-9640

The book is a valuable addition to the history of northern Yorke Peninsula, with its detailed descriptions of the events of the Great War by those local men who witnessed them at first hand. The main characters are the local – otherwise nondescript – men who enlisted rather than the usual ‘successful worthies’ who generally populate local histories, or the officer class who generally feature in war histories. The book has the benefit of focusing on a particular group of men to explain aspects of the War rather than needing to draw on examples from diverse areas to illustrate points raised. The author is able to do this primarily by drawing on articles and letters that appeared in the local press, and soldiers’ service records and those of the Red Cross now available in the internet.

Titled *Regional Australia and the Great War*, the book concentrates on the Great War – particularly the Gallipoli and Western Front campaigns – and the experiences of the men from KIO, rather than on the effects of the war in the region: KIO, as the author explains, is code for Moonta. And in this aspect, I sensed a certain tension in the book. The title suggests the book seeks to include the whole of the region of northern Yorke Peninsula, encompassing Moonta, Wallaroo and Kadina and surrounding districts: but, as the subtitle indicates, the emphasis is on ‘The boys from old KIO’, and there is a seeming reluctance to include those from Wallaroo and Kadina.

I have to admit that the book’s title and my general knowledge of the region’s history meant that I approached it with particular expectations. In several instances, these were not met to the extent that I anticipated. The northern part of Yorke Peninsula, with its copper mines and smelting works, would have been one of the few parts of Australia to have its economy directly influenced by the War. I expected more in-depth examination and explanation of the loss of the German market, and then access to the British market and war production, the effect of enlistments on the mines and smelters, and the economic impact of the war on the region generally. The book makes the point well that the war boosted copper production from the region and ultimately led to the collapse afterwards. But, while being asserted, this is not explained.

The region about Moonta, Wallaroo and Kadina is noteworthy for its strong Cornish links and traditions. As the author explains, the Great War served to reinforce the mutual ties between Cornwall and ‘Little Cornwall’ because of those soldiers from KIO and surrounds who used their leave or rehabilitation to explore their roots and establish and/or re-establish family connections.

The book makes a great deal of the local divisions caused by the conscription issue in 1916 and 1917, and is particularly good in detailing the pro-conscription stance of the Methodist Church. But the book does not explore the extent or ramifications of these divisions. The chapter is headed ‘Not only Germany’s war, it’s Rome’s war too’; this raises expectations that the chapter will address the role/place of local Roman Catholics in the issues, but this is not developed, beyond mention of the Methodist general ‘nonconformist hostility to Roman Catholicism’, and the fact that Melbourne’s Archbishop Mannix opposed conscription. The book highlights the paradox that the region generally voted against conscription despite the staunch support of it by the Methodist Church to which most local people adhered. This paradox owed more to the influence of union attitudes than religious
allegiances and bears more in-depth explanation. There is probably more space given to describing the effect of the conscription issue on the career of one-time premier John Verran than exploring and explaining the social divisions created.

Despite the book’s title, little is really written about the home-front. Women – mainly the mothers – are seen as passive sufferers, rather than active participants in the local war effort. There are references to their knitting woollen comforts, but – elsewhere certainly – women were active in the Red Cross, in fund-raising activities, in helping to organise successive Australia Days and Violet Days, and in welcoming back returned and wounded soldiers. There is only a brief mention in two paragraphs of three nurses from the region who enlisted, and no mention of them in the index.

The book mentions only briefly the activities of KIO men in Palestine, those who joined the Air Corps, and those taken as prisoners-of-war. Little is said of those who married English women, or any who used their time in England after the war to gain new qualifications.

These quibbles aside, the book is a delight to read, even though the author has a tendency to use unusual words: he uses the word ‘élan’ three times in one paragraph, and refers to Elsie Bishop ‘expiring’. Maps of northern Yorke Peninsula, the Gallipoli Peninsula and northern France help to orient the reader, and there are photographs to illustrate points made in the text.

The book will appeal to any reader interested in aspects of the Great War. Its strength is the attention to detail and the personalising of the experiences of those who participated in and were impacted by the Great War and the social forces evident in northern Yorke Peninsula during this short period. It will be invaluable to people of the region in enabling them to relate closely to what their forebears endured.

Peter Donovan
Donovan & Associates


Geoffrey C. Bishop has a long record as a local wine historian – he was a contributor to Vineyards of The Empire, a seminal collection of essays on colonial South Australian winemaking published in 1988. This commissioned, corporate history sees him tell the story of the 125-odd years of the Angove family’s wine and brandy enterprise.

The Angoves date their operations back to the arrival at Tea Tree Gully of Cornish migrant and patriarch Dr William Angove in 1886 (even if winemaking did not strictly begin until the 1890s). A Journey in Wine tracks the major developments in the family’s subsequent business strategies and fortunes. After the foundation of the Angove vineyards at Tea Tree Gully, the next most significant event for the company was the 1910 acquisition of a distillery and vineyards in the Riverland, and Renmark soon became both family and corporate home. At a time when table wine consumption held little social sway, the capacity to produce brandy, under the famous St Agnes label, was to remain the company’s mainstay for most of the 20th century.

Always a model of diversification in its products, in the past two decades the company grasped the necessity of undertaking a second major transformation: the falling popularity and profitability of brandy has led Angove to remodel itself as a producer of fine wine, focusing its operations in McLaren Vale.

Bishop is thorough in documenting the change. And as befits a family-based company, plenty of credit is given to the achievements of the long-term employees as well as those of presiding family figure Tom, a legend of the industry who died in 2010, and his son and successor, John Angove.

The large-format, softcover book contains numerous historical and modern photographs. While a history, it doubles as a promotional showcase, airing the recent technological,
strategic and marketing developments of the company’s operations, including a continuing foray into environmental and organic practices.

Overall, it is a workmanlike history that successfully conveys the adaptability and resilience that a family business requires to remain profitable for more than a century in the face of constant technological, economic and social change.

Charles Gent
Flinders University


It presented a series of streetscapes formed from the pasting together of individual photographs of the commercial buildings in the selected streets, complemented with details of those businesses which occupied the buildings or, at least, those which paid a fee to have their buildings identified. This was clearly a commercial as well as a patriotic venture. With its lively picture of the life of the city at that time, it is pleasing that the City Council has sponsored the reproduction of the book, and admirable that the new publication is a handsome one.

This new edition published under the title City Streets: progressive Adelaide 75 years on is an impressively large book with a fine black glossy cover, full of illustrations depicting the history and development of the City of Adelaide. It also adds to the record of Adelaide’s city buildings by presenting a modern version of its city streets, and the ‘then and now’ photographs are intrinsically interesting in demonstrating changes that have taken place over a lifetime or more.

However, the text of City Streets accompanying the illustrations is rather less satisfactory. Although some information given is pertinent, it is unclear how it is chosen and who it is chosen for. It veers between pleas for conservation and a presentation of the genesis of buildings and their history. Those who have some familiarity with the history of the city will find what is presented familiar. Other parts are self-congratulatory, particularly those describing the production of the book and those who worked on it. This is particularly irritating because the producers of the original volume are treated less respectfully.

Then other parts are not of the kind to give insight into the forces which make or change a city. Indeed, sometimes it is downright disrespectful to past figures who have a legitimate place in its history. There is a fundamental contradiction between what I take to be the purpose of the book – a celebration of Adelaide as a city – and the overly light-hearted dismissal of historical figures: denigration is pitted against celebration. Finally, some of those who presumably informed the publication are given the opportunity to express views that can only be described as ‘gratuitous’. Here is an example: the Multicultural Affairs Building in Flinders Street ‘should become a heritage hotel’. Why, and on whose authority?

Nor is the text always well-written; its somewhat forced attempts at informality can descend into inanity. For instance: Dame Roma’s statue ‘takes a long term view of secret men’s business in the Adelaide Club across the road’. Or, what is this one supposed to mean? ‘The heritage people would like to see more of similar around the city streets.’ Or the ‘Thistle Hotel now changed to a five-star European style luxury’.

From all this one might conclude that Lance Campbell cannot write well and is under-informed about issues affecting heritage, conservation and/or development. Actually, this is not so. His summary piece ‘From the Heart’ is clearly expressed, and so are the relevant issues. It is an intelligent
summary. One has to question the extent to which others might have contributed to the more didactic main body of the text and by doing so downgraded it.

I now turn to the photographs and their presentation. Again the process of the modern production is lauded, given drama, and the new photographer given greater kudos than the original one. The difference is striking, and the description of the modern process is overblown – almost as overblown as the colouring of the photos themselves. An excessive richness of hue can lead to garishness and sometimes does. That is a pity because it detracts from the very fine images, particularly those introducing each section.

All this said, there is much pleasure to be derived from the close comparison of streetscapes juxtaposed to each other but with a gap of 75 years between them. The producers of this book have worked hard to present the original photographs more clearly than they appeared in Progressive Adelaide and must also have worked hard to match the new streetscapes to the old so that comparison between them is seamless and so that pleasure can be readily derived from that comparison.

A comparison facilitates speculation as to what processes have made the changes which are so apparent and what has been lost or gained by them. In describing some of these I am moving to a more serious critique and appreciation of what has been presented.

First, one can muse on what facilitates change and what impedes it even without its regulation. Adelaide’s legacy of pervasive small scale development has discouraged consolidation of sites for modern larger-scale development. The consequence seems to have been for new buildings often to have been built on the sites of larger buildings from the past. Hence Adelaide lost, for example, Myer’s, Foy’s and Reid’s. It can be argued that these were of greater historical importance than their smaller neighbours. It can also be noted that because planning controls are often circumvented for larger-scale projects the replacement of the original building is doubly likely. The photos show the substantial buildings we have lost.

It is also clear from the photographs that a relatively small proportion of the square mile has been subject to the most replacement, so much so that pressures for redevelopment have engulfed buildings that were constructed and demolished between the two records. One of Adelaide’s earliest modernist buildings, the Advertiser building, is the prime example. Consequently, one should not assume that the photos are a complete record of the history of building over this period. In more peripheral areas, change has obviously been slower, and small-scale sites and buildings have persisted.

Jan Gehl, the eminent urban design consultant, has commented on the modern Adelaide streetscape, noting how much of it has become sterile and non-interactive. The earlier photographs clearly show how much livelier the central area was in the 30’s. Large modern developments without an active frontage have made Adelaide a more boring place to walk around and discourage pedestrian participation in the city. Dull streetscapes are most obvious in those areas which have been overtaken by modern office development. Again the photographs are a clear record of this decline.

Because the original project was by its nature oriented to commercial parts of the city, it gave a skewed picture of the Adelaide of the time. Government buildings were less likely to be shown and residential buildings almost not at all. The new publication has to some degree redressed this imbalance by presenting more public and cultural buildings, but neither publication presents the city square mile as a whole. What is arguably a very special feature of it – a city within a city – is lost. Nonetheless, I hope that City Streets stimulates readers to think about and to care for our City. It has the potential to do so.

Judith Brine
Adelaide

This book is based on a series of lectures delivered at the University of Adelaide in 2011 to mark the 175th Anniversary Celebrations. The title was apparently thought up after the event.

Books on the South Australian story like this are important to correct a growing bias towards ‘east coast history’. Knowledge of the ‘differences’ in South Australia is gradually being lost and even the subject of ridicule. The response of Western Australians to the east coast bias is consciously to develop their own literature and history. But we seem to be both too near to and too far from Melbourne and Sydney.

All of the contributors to *Turning Points* write from their field of expertise: Bill Gammage on how European settlement changed the environment around Adelaide; Henry Reynolds on European law and Aboriginal rights in South Australia; Paul Sendziuk on how South Australians constructed their identity of difference; Robert Foster and Amanda Nettelbeck on how they celebrated this ‘difference’ by the way they celebrated ‘Proclamation Day’; Susan Magarey on the growth of women’s citizenship via the women’s vote and the right to become paid employees; Jill Roe adds the country and suburban perspective to the story; Neal Blewett on Premier Don Dunstan as a quintessential South Australian; and finally John Hirst on whether South Australia is really so different.

The most challenging chapter for the present and future is ‘South Australia: Between Van Diemen’s Land and New Zealand’, by Henry Reynolds. The main thrust of the chapter is that South Australia was settled just at a time which the British Government and the Colonial Office were re-thinking and changing the policy of *Terra Nullius*. It was a time between the *Terra Nullius* of Tasmania and New South Wales and the Treaty of Waitangi in New Zealand in 1840. The result has been a pattern of confusion about the land rights of Indigenous people in South Australia.

According to Reynolds the new outlook is seen in the Reform Act of 1832 and the Abolition of Slavery Act of 1833. The Colonisation Commissioners for South Australia were well aware of the changed mood. But they hoped that the *Terra Nullius* approach common elsewhere in the continent would still apply – particularly because land sales were at the centre of the South Australian experiment.

Since then there has been a tendency to ignore the provisions of the Letters Patent. Reynolds then goes on to suggest that this will not be allowed to continue following the legal precedents laid down in Mabo and Wik. Even at the 2013 Writers’ Week in Adelaide Aboriginal authors turned up waving copies of the Letters Patent.

I heartily recommend this book to all readers. The style is serious
Jack Cross  
University of South Australia


Cusack’s account of life as an air gunner was written with a cathartic intent – he wished to drive away some of the demons that had remained with him many years after the war. To do this he invented a character by the name of ‘John Beede’ and told his story, from his enlistment and initial training in Australia through to his three tours with Bomber Command in the skies over Europe. The account is no doubt as convincing as it is because so much of it is drawn from Cusack’s experiences, even if ‘John Beede’ is fictional. The extent of the creativity which transformed the real-life ‘Cusack’ into ‘Beede’ is helpfully described in one of the appendices.

The value of this book lies in large part in the insight it provides into the operations of Bomber Command, told from the perspective of a humble air gunner. The perils of such a job are well known, moreover they are announced in the book’s title. While death rates were inordinately high among all RAF and RAAF aircrew, gunners were necessarily placed in the most vulnerable of positions. Stories of gun turrets being ‘hosed out’ after operations may be apocryphal, but the acute mental and physical demands placed on the gunners were real, and they are compellingly portrayed here. While large parts of a gunner’s operational deployment were marked by isolation, freezing temperatures and inactivity, there were critical moments when the gunner’s wits and skills were put to the severest test. One of Cusack’s great achievements is to convey to the reader those moments of high danger and suspense. On numerous occasions Beede is exposed to acute danger and yet contrives to secure his survival, even when fellow crew members are less fortunate.

Cusack was the younger brother of the novelist Dymphna Cusack. As Cusack’s daughter Kerry McCourt points out in a revealing family memoir, Dymphna played some role in encouraging her brother to record his memories (pp.355-56). Her literary talents might have rubbed off on him. Just one of countless examples of John Cusack’s deft touch will suffice here. A German fighter pilot stuck to Beede’s bomber ‘like porridge to a blanket’. There follows the characteristic use of an Australian idiom: ‘[…] like a rabbit in the family way pursued by a kangaroo dog we zig-zagged around the sky.’ (p.96)

While his writing might have been influenced by Dymphna, John Cusack’s political views are not as strident as those of his sister. Nonetheless, Cusack’s attention to the social world of the airmen is informative; he details not only the camaraderie that unites the aircrew, but also the divisions and inequities that abounded outside that tight-knit group. They ran along a number of lines, not least of them rank. While Beede himself finally became an officer, it was with some misgivings. Temperamentally he was more closely attached to the NCOs, and he was well aware of the disadvantages of that more modest rank. It was only the psychologically damaged NCO, for example, who risked being categorized ‘LMF’ (Lacking Moral Fibre); officers were spared that ignominy. Then there were divisions between aircrew and those in secure desk jobs. Despite reaching an impressive tally of operations and sustaining multiple
injuries, Beede has some troubles persuading the authorities on the ground that he had more than done his bit. Then there were the multiple nationalities that made up the crews. Beede forms friendships with men from many parts of the world, yet the sense of shared identity and tacit mutual comprehension appears strongest when Beede is among his countrymen. His observation of temperamental differences between English crew and those from the Commonwealth is keen: ‘We found the average English aircrew took all that was handed out to them without complaining. The Australians, New Zealanders and Canadians, however, kicked hard against injustice.’ (p. 43)

And then there was sex, indeed much more of it than one might have expected in what might be assumed to be less permissive times. Indeed, the prevalence of a ‘carpe diem’ mentality among young men and women is striking. As much as the compelling descriptions of battles fought over the skies of Europe, Cusack’s accounts of amorous adventures on the home-front convey a sense of lives lived to the fullest in the shadow of death.

Readers who might be familiar with earlier editions of this gripping story should note that it has been supplemented with hitherto unpublished chapters, extra material in a numerous chapters, extensive notes, an introduction by Robert Brokenmouth, a series of 3 appendices (including an intriguing account of Cusack’s efforts to escape the stress of war by surfing in Cornwall) and a touching afterword by Cusack’s daughter. Apart from providing biographical information on Cusack – as opposed to the fictionalized ‘John Beede’ – it confirms a suspicion hinted at in the story of Beede. For Cusack, as for his alter ego, heroic service and the gift of survival came at a cost. For both mind and his body, the war remained with him for the rest of his days.

Peter Monteath
Flinders University


Daviborsch’s Cart is an important account of the controversial Nazi War Crimes trials that took place in Adelaide in the late 1980s and early 1990s. It is an important historical record because it is the first significant and detailed account of these cases. As the author explains, the archival materials should be opened up for more detailed analysis because his work is but a ‘first, incomplete and tentative step’ (p.319) towards setting the historical record. However the importance of the book is not so much its historical account of the cases themselves but a scholarly analysis of a failed attempt to synchronise the disciplines of law and history; as Fraser points out, ‘History ... knows neither guilt nor innocence. To employ the disciplinary narrative of history in such legal proceedings will only distort the criminal process and the goals of the professional historian.’ (p.137)

The author sets out to tell the story of the trials from the passage of the relevant legislation through to the investigation and the hearings themselves. As part of this process Fraser observes that Australian prosecutors had to rely on ‘historical expertise not only to establish the technical elements of the war crimes offences … but to establish the identity and culpability of the individuals accused’ (pp.8-9). The author achieves these objectives in a well written and accurate account the events. The book should be of interest to the historian and the lawyer alike, but the clarity of his writing makes it an interesting read for anyone interested in this important part of European and Australian history.
the exposition of the true picture of the international crime and reduce it to the domestic equivalent of a murder or serious assault, where minor details such as what people wore, what they said and what they carried can become the most important feature of the case. Clearly when the circumstances surrounding the commission of these massive crimes are being recalled by the testifying witness, such seemingly innocuous details are lost in the horror of the main event. What especially complicated the Australian proceedings was that this lack of minor detail was compounded by the great passage of time (in excess of fifty years) and the enormous problems associated with the sequential translation from the Ukrainian language into the English language and the many incompatible cultural practices which accompanied this compromised translation process.

While it is clear that Fraser has little tolerance for ‘Holocaust deniers and revisionists’ and less tolerance for Demidenko/Daville’s book The Hand that Signed the Paper (Chapter 7), he can rejoice in the fact that he is not alone in taking a strong position on these issues. Apart from demonstrating a commendable bias on these matters and perhaps devoting too much of his book to Demidenko/Daville, the book is nevertheless a balanced, well researched and important contribution to the historical record.

Grant Niemann
Flinders University, prosecuting counsel in the 1980-90 Australian War crimes cases.


Early on, Bruce Munday confesses to a longstanding interest in dry-stone walls, as far back as his childhood growing up in Geelong. In this publication, he describes his travels around South Australia in search of walls – discovering and documenting them, and the stories and people associated with them. His focus is dry-stone walls which he defines as those without mortar, or originally with mud mortar which has now weathered away.

Munday has an engaging, chatty style that makes this book easy to pick up and dip into. His text is supported by Kristin Munday’s striking and atmospheric photographs, which highlight the isolation in which many of the wallers worked during the nineteenth century. These wallers brought techniques with them from their home countries such as Scotland, Ireland, Italy and Germany, and adapted them for use in their new environment. The Camel’s Hump wall in the Mid North, for example, which runs for 65 kilometres and is the longest stone wall in the state, is built in a style known as the Galloway dyke, introduced from Scotland and similar to a style known as Feidin in Ireland.

All of South Australia’s regions are covered – the Mount Lofty Ranges and the Murray Plains, north beyond Goyder’s Line to the Flinders Ranges, west to the Yorke and Eyre Peninsulas, and south to Kangaroo Island and the South East. Whilst not specifically an historical, anthropological or engineering publication, it also is not just about stone walls – it is an overview of the countryside and landscape, vegetation types, and local historical and geological information on stone types and their ease or not of being worked. Munday provides many interesting details on stone terms and construction methods, which can usefully be employed as diagnostic terms to describe walls accurately.

Local people feature extensively, and Munday acknowledges their influence on the preservation and maintenance of South Australian stone walls. They have shared invaluable histories with him of the walls and early European settlement, and have provided access to diaries such as Joseph Keynes’ journals that paint a picture of daily rural life in the eastern Mount Lofty Ranges during the mid-nineteenth century. Munday sees old walls as landscape features that ‘individually and collectively help write the history of the region’ (p.19).
In the final chapters, Munday examines stone walls in the broader sense, ranging from the walls and gorges formed by natural rock fractures to stone walls overseas, and their use locally as both functional and decorative features. He gives a summary of South Australian stone sources, and provides short biographies of some wallers, 'old and recent, professional and amateur, but all interesting' (p.160). He finishes with a summary of his own experiences building four stone walls on his property in the Adelaide Hills, outlining the lessons learned from each wall and applied to the next.

This book assumes some knowledge of South Australia and is probably of most interest locally. It will certainly appeal to those interested in stone walls and early construction methods in South Australia. However, it also has a wider audience in those interested in the heritage of South Australia.

Susan Arthure
Flinders University


Dickey’s history eloquently conveys a sense of difference that runs almost continuously through the community’s history. Gathered Anglican parishes, whatever the shade of their Anglicanism, have often provided a home for those who sensed something missing from the prevailing parish norms or overtly objected to them – in their own eyes, representatives of true Anglicanism in a naughty diocese, refugees of conscience. Their members are often well-informed on their own position, and offer more articulate critiques of wider Anglicanism than those heard in the mainstream; their clear doctrinal positions are important in bonding the community.

In moulding and maintaining diocesan identities, bishops have played an important role, exercising more direct influence at times in the colonies than in Anglicanism’s homeland. The story of Holy Trinity, as much as that of some Anglo-Catholic churches elsewhere in Australia, is often one of tensions between the parish and the diocesan bishop or others in the hierarchy. It is important to note that Holy Trinity had already established an evangelical profile before the arrival of Augustus Short, Adelaide’s first bishop. In dealing with these episodes, Dickey avoids demonising bishops while remaining convinced of the rightness of the parish’s resistance – a delicate feat. (In Adelaide, the most acrimonious relations between...
bishop and clergy probably did not involve evangelicals, but rather the protracted standoff between Father Percy Wise of St George’s Goodwood and Bishop Nutter Thomas at the end of World War I).

Dickey’s account of Holy Trinity reminds readers of two of the great strengths of evangelical Anglicanism: its systematic programmes for youth, and its study courses. Holy Trinity avoided the directions taken by the charismatic movement, a renewal movement that developed momentum in the 1970s, but was often a divisive influence. Instead, the later chapters demonstrate the extent to which Holy Trinity embraced the highly propositional evangelicalism of the Sydney archdiocese; this was a far more cerebral approach, in contrast to the emotionally-driven charismatic world. Dickey’s useful discussion of the definition of evangelical Christianity in the introduction is an important reminder that evangelical Christianity, including its Anglican manifestation, is not a uniform stream. It has its own shades and permutations. Might Dickey have made more of this in connection with Lance Shilton, rector between 1957 and 1973? Shilton was an outstanding product of the evangelical Anglicanism of Melbourne, subtly different from its Sydney counterpart. What Dickey describes earlier in his history in connection with Reg Fulford, the rector during the interwar years, is an aesthetic evangelicalism of a kind that appeared elsewhere at much the same time. Some possibly felt that he was not always definite enough, compromising at the edges, and therefore a threat to identity.

While there have been occasional signs more recently of something like a low-level dialogue between the diocese and parish, the nature of their relationship remains problematic. The concept of parish as understood by the diocese, and the perimeters of the archbishop’s authority as traditionally understood, sit uncomfortably with Holy Trinity’s highly successful exercises in church planting. How the two might continue to have a meaningful relationship in the future is far from clear. Their situation is mirrored on a wider scale in ongoing tensions within the Anglican Church, both nationally and internationally. In terms of numbers, as Dickey’s study implies, committed evangelical parishes like Holy Trinity are far better placed to face the future than those of more traditional or liberal kinds of Anglicanism, which have been in varying degrees of decline over the past fifty years. But mainstream Australian culture poses a much larger question for all faith communities, in its general inability to envisage religion as having a positive role to play in public life. If Holy Trinity – and indeed any other religious body – is to contribute effectively as part of a larger Australian community, it will be essential to find new answers as to how to live out a religious commitment effectively beyond the private sphere.

**Colin Holden**  
University of Melbourne

Alison Painter, *Beer Barons or Bankrupts? Early brewers in South Australia*, published with the assistance from Coopers Brewery Ltd, West End Brewery (Lion) and History SA, Richmond SA, 2012, pp. 234, illus., rrp. $60.50, hbk.

Brewing was one of the first industries in every colony, not least in South Australia. Like other early starters, brewing was an import-replacement activity, relatively low in its capital and technical requirements. Local brewers were protected from competition by distance, and they served traditional needs among the immigrant consumers; their taste for alcohol was soon extended to the Aboriginal population. Breweries sprang up like mushrooms in Adelaide and even in remote outback places, but suffered a high rate of mortality and bankruptcy. Colonial brewers faced a number of disadvantages beyond the sharp competition generated by the ease of entry into the industry. Beer was a relatively simple but temperamental product. Local conditions and raw materials, the water supply...
and the summer heat in particular, made quality control an endless problem. In 1868 it was recollected that ‘a glass of colonial beer’ was ‘once synonymous with a splitting headache’. Moreover the imported product was generally superior – indeed ale apparently improved during transit from England. Brewing nevertheless became big business in South Australia, and it had an important and turbulent role in the making of colonial society and after.

Business history has not flourished in South Australia, and the study of economic history has languished despite its obvious centrality, now more than ever. It is therefore good to have one of the important sectors fully documented. Alison Painter, who has almost cornered the market in beer studies, has scoured all sources and accumulated an astonishing quantity of information about every South Australian brewery, aided by modern search facilities such as Trove. It is now possible to retrieve virtually every reference in the digitised newspapers – presenting the researcher with the danger of drowning in minutiae.

In late Victorian Britain the great brewers, the so-called ‘Beerage’, were famously successful in high society and politically influential too. They were dominant capitalists in the largest of the food trades, made rich by the thirst of the working people, and by successful, often oligopolistic, business methods. It was a colourful and significant story, replicated on a smaller scale in South Australia. Here too was a long history of adulteration, of poor quality control, of an industry riddled with restrictive practices of price fixing and collusion. It also displayed a marked tendency to amalgamation, especially associated with the rise of the tied-house system by which large brewers were able to control the outlets for their own beers. The brewing trade caused considerable environmental problems, especially regarding its effluent. It is a story that contained important examples of the different modes of company formation, including co-operatives. Brewing was also a political matter and government interference and social pressures affected business enterprise. Licensing hours and excise duties were critical factors, and beyond these loomed the temperance movement which, over many decades, made valiant but largely unavailing efforts to curb the consumption of alcohol.

South Australia’s brewers had to contend with sharp shifts in demand for their product and their fortunes provide a precise measure of the state of the local economy. For instance, the growth of beer consumption after 1945 was astonishing. Shifting tastes, between bitter beer, lager and stout, and between draft and bottled beer, demanded adjustments within the industry. Technical changes in production, storage, refrigeration, bottling and distribution created challenges for small brewers in remote places, and eventually they were all overwhelmed by the sheer power of emerging economies of scale and vertical integration. In earlier days there were remarkable attempts to set up breweries at great distances for population centres, as at Blinman, Beltana and Pichi Richi. But the centralising tendencies were evident as early as the 1880s and there is no hiding the heart-ache and broken dreams of so many of these collapsed enterprises. It was a Darwinian struggle and, of the dozens of commercial breweries lovingly documented by Alison Painter, only two now survive.

This is a book for enthusiasts of the beer industry and its products. It is a sumptuous production and wonderfully illustrated on almost every page – evidently sponsored by the industry for its own edification. Rich biographical, technical, legal and commercial documentation relating to every brewery is reproduced to the point of profusion. Such exquisite detail may have a numbing effect on those who do not share such a passion for recondite brewing lore. The purpose of this account is to record each of the large number of breweries that proliferated in the colony and were then whittled down to the present-day duopoly. And there are many fascinating and poignant stories, including the awful industrial accidents which befell so many of the working brewers. For anyone wanting information about the sparging of the wash, or wort coolers and so much more, this will be a source of pleasure. Painter explicitly eschews any interpretative or technical version of her important story, instead opting for a decade by decade, hoghead by hoghead, descriptive account. It is chronological compendium of encyclopaedic detail which carries all the strengths and weakness of its approach. It is an elaborate collation not a connected explanation; it does not seek to illuminate the wider
questions about the role of brewing in society and the economy. This is an unpretentious chronicle of information, a small mountain of raw data which will be invaluable to any understanding of the large and contentious place of the brewer in South Australian life and culture.

Eric Richards
Flinders University


Some men's private clubs in London are very old: White's dates from 1693, Boodle's 1762, Brooks's 1778, and another fifteen surviving ones were founded before the Adelaide Club. Visitors from continental countries and, especially, the United States liked them and established counterparts in their own cities. Emigrating Britons followed suit in far-flung places such as Sydney (its oldest being the Australian Club, 1838), Melbourne (1839), Wellington (1841), Hong Kong (1846) and Montreal (1857), Brisbane (the Queensland Club 1860) and Hobart (the Tasmanian Club 1861). All have a library as well as dining, sitting and games rooms, reciprocal arrangements with similar clubs around the world, and almost all offer accommodation. Membership is by invitation, but all who accept nomination by the required number of sponsors have to await approval in a ballot. This enables anyone who has knowledge that a candidate can be a crushing bore, or might use the privilege of membership to tout for clients, to let their views be known and considered. The Adelaide Club is the oldest institution of this kind in South Australia, and is still cherished for its service and facilities.

As happened in the case of Sir Edward Morgan's centenary history (The Adelaide Club 1863–1963), it is inevitable that, as time passes, some members of the Club will present copies of Rob Linn's book to libraries or offer them to second-hand bookellers, and still more likely that heirs or executors of some other members will do the same. Hence the new volume merits appraisal in this journal. After a long career as a barrister, magistrate, president of this state's Industrial Court and then a judge, Morgan, who had been a member of the Club since 1925, wrote his history of it in the first years of his retirement. He had a profound knowledge of the subject. His grandfather, Sir William Morgan, and his father, had been members. His book was invaluable to biographers and social historians. The new one will disappoint such people. Although it deals with fifty additional years, in which the Club grew and changed at a faster pace than it had in its first century, only 16 per cent of the text of Linn's chapters is devoted to the period since 1963. This section is supplemented by a freer use of photographs. While their captions help to tell the story, more detail on the latest era should have been presented. Even so, there is much of interest.

Although it lacks depth and contains too many clichés, Linn's account has pleased most of those for whom it had been written. A thousand
copies sold quickly. Like the new histories of St Peter's and Scotch Colleges, it looks like a coffee-table book, due to its being printed on glossy paper and having 185 pictures (as opposed to the 18 photos and 12 charming drawings Morgan had used). This must be what the Club's committee assumed is what's now wanted in any celebratory or commemorative volume, for we live at a time when few books are read from cover to cover. Those elderly and frail members who can now visit only rarely if at all (they value the attachment too much to resign), will appreciate the reproductions of some of the Club's best-loved artworks. It was unnecessary, however, to use 18 photos and engravings of the façade for that has been altered only minimally since the place opened. More interesting are the photos showing its location in North Terrace, recording how, from being the tallest, it has become the shortest building between King William Street and Stephens Place, but there was no justification for including well-known pictures of other Adelaide Streets when the space they occupy could have been used to enrich the narrative. There should have been better images of the Club's grand staircase and the splendidly renovated Old Billiard Room, now turned into another dining area.

To write this new history the Club's committee engaged a historian who earns his living by writing commissioned works. Such a person often becomes constrained by directions and is subject to censorship. When the Club's committee was considering the production of a new history in 1995, a senior member had warned: 'If the Club chose a complaisant outside historian it would run the risk of being provided with a sycophantic or saccharine account.' He agreed with the committee's then chairman that 'it would be appropriate to select a member to write the book'. That has worked very successfully in many other cases, as in Frank Green's history of the Tasmanian Club, Ronald McNicoll's on the Melbourne Club and John Pacini's on the Athenaeum, also in Melbourne. It's comparable to the writing of the history of a religious denomination. Though an outsider can sometimes offer fresh insights, for an account that is written without prejudice but with sympathy and understanding, it is hard to beat an insider.

One of the great merits of Sir Edward Morgan's work has been that its chapter 14 presents lively vignettes of twenty of the Club's more colourful members. Another is its Appendix A, offering briefer information about the 130 'Foundation Members' – those who joined in 1863-64. A third is its Appendix D, naming all the members admitted from July 1863 to January 1963, with the dates of their election. These features, which have been a goldmine for researchers, have no counterparts in the new volume. Why? Was the committee unnecessarily fearful of the implications of recent privacy laws? I have never met anyone who does not take pride in his membership, and the fact of membership has, in scores of cases since the 1940s, been recorded in the successive issues of *Who's Who in Australia* – though quarrying them requires much time and patience. The authors of histories of many affiliated clubs, including overseas ones, have not been so coy. John Campbell's on the Queensland Club, for example, devotes 34 pages to listing all its members from 1859 to 2009, giving their occupations as well as their dates of joining. A welcome feature of Linn's book is that it presents images of 33 of the members who contributed to the Adelaide Club's growth and survival, but he focuses too much on the development of the premises, past problems with staff and management, challenges posed by fire, earthquake and excavations for adjacent buildings, heritage listing, the once-common financial crises, and the long drawn out (but still incomplete) negotiations for a merger with the Queen Adelaide Club, founded by and for women in 1909. Another puzzle is: why were not a few copies of his book made available for sale and review? I see nothing that could not safely be disclosed to the public. Professor Ernest Scott's book on the Melbourne Club, Ronald McNicoll's more recent work on the same subject, and the sesquicentenary history of Sydney's Australian Club by J.R. Angel (a member who was a senior lecturer in history) were all produced with the imprints of commercial publishers.

It is a pity we are not given more social analysis and a fuller picture of the life of the Club. Balls have not been held there since the huge William Morris rugs were replaced by wall-to-wall carpeting. But in recent decades the highlight of each year has been 'The Party', attended by hundreds of members and their partners. All four levels of the building are brought into service, usually with different kinds of music being performed in each,
and the flower arrangements are as memorable as the wine and food. Other recreation is no longer confined to billiards, bridge and occasional golf tournaments. Chamber-music concerts as well as lieder and piano recitals are usually oversubscribed. Many new groups have been formed, facilitating and encouraging activities ranging from fishing and bushwalking to painting, discussing books, and art gallery visits. Perhaps the most successful conducts a monthly history luncheon and an annual history dinner. Each of its events begins with a talk, usually by an invited non-member, with questions, discussion and debate deferred until after the main course has been consumed. Up to 55 members and guests attend the lunches, more turning up for the dinner. Such innovations merited notice.

Instead of writing about difficulties with an alcoholic butler, Linn could have recorded Sir Collier Cudmore’s response to the question: ‘Have you ever fallen down the front steps of the Club?’ put to him by a member who wanted a centre rail erected on those steps. Cudmore replied: ‘Yes, hundreds of times!’ Younger and future members would also be interested to know that, during Cudmore’s battle in the Legislative Council in 1945-6, trying to block Liberal Country League Premier Playford’s Bill to nationalise the Adelaide Electricity Supply Co. Ltd, it was in the Club that, on hearing someone mention Parliament, he exclaimed: ‘That’s where that bloody Bolshevik Playford lives.’ The cleverest utterance the writer has heard about was delivered in 1977, when Premier Dunstan announced the appointment of Keith Seaman, superintendent of the Adelaide Central Mission, as the next state governor. Standing at a window of the Annexe, George Symes (a founder and vice-president of the National Trust of SA), looking down upon Government House across the road observed: ‘So that’s the new Mission to Seamen!’ Linn does mention the Annexe, created in 1962-63 by refurbishing a floor as a drawing-room with adjacent dining areas, kitchen and a powder room, to be a place where members would be able to bring their wives. But it occupies the third storey, not the second. For many years, the drawing room was a delight, but after its recent redecoration, some members complained that they felt embarrassed about taking their wives there now that it resembles ‘the set for a film about a fin de siecle Parisian brothel’. Architect Ron Danvers replied: ‘That’s precisely the effect I was trying to achieve!’ Again, much of the space Linn devotes to the Club’s premises would have been better used by borrowing more than one of the anecdotes that have been unearthed by Roger André, formerly senior archivist at the State Library, for his column, ‘Remember When?’ in the Club’s monthly newsletter.

Linn’s work is well-documented but has a fault that diminishes the value of much writing on South Australian history, namely, failure to show proper awareness of what was happening elsewhere. There should have been something about relationships with other gentlemen’s clubs in Adelaide, interstate and overseas. Comparisons are useful for identifying what is most significant about one’s subject. One notable feature of the Adelaide Club is that it has never barred potential members on religious grounds. In the present century, claims have been made that in two instances it did occur (one candidate was a Catholic, the other a Jew). I took an active interest in both cases and can affirm that religion had nothing to do with either. In each instance it was manifest that some feature of the public behaviour of those individuals was the obstacle.

Several of the Adelaide Club’s counterparts, notably the Melbourne Club, Sydney’s Australian Club and the Tasmanian Club took a century before they admitted a Jew or a Catholic. By contrast, one of the two founders of the Adelaide Club, Philip Levi, was an active member of Adelaide’s Hebrew Congregation. He was promptly joined by his brother, Edmund. Their early involvement in the Club illustrates the view that religious toleration was being confirmed as one of South Australia’s distinguishing characteristics. There has been a steady accession of people of Jewish faith or descent ever since. Linn has much to say about Philip Levi, but it is strange that he makes no mention of that man’s religion. It was probably fortunate for the province’s Catholics that in November 1861 Queen Victoria had commissioned a Catholic, Sir Dominick Daly, to succeed Sir Richard MacDonnell as Governor of South Australia. One of his sons, John George Daly, a practising solicitor, became a foundation member of the Club. This too paved the way for others of the same faith. A Spanish-born one with a grandiose name, José María Jacobo Rafael Ramon Francisco Gabriel Del Corazon de Jesus
Gordon Y Prendergast, became more widely known as Colonel Joseph Gordon, commandant of South Australia’s volunteer military forces. By the 1980s, Catholics formed a significant proportion of the Club’s membership, and in this its sesquicentenary year the Club has chosen a Catholic to be its next president. The Adelaide Club also seems to have been the first of its kind in Australia to admit to membership a Muslim and, soon afterwards, a Hindu.

Late in the 1980s, Sir Edward Morgan’s son Peter, a member since 1951, was asked by the Club’s committee to summarize what matters needed to be included in any new book on the Club’s history. His report ran to 37 typed foolscap pages. Foremost in his list of recommendations was the necessity of making use of the findings presented in two articles by a political scientist and historian, John Playford. These are: ‘The Adelaide Club: myth and reality’, Quadrant, July 1981, pp 58-60, and ‘The Adelaide Club and Politics’, a chapter in The Flinders History of South Australia: political history, ed. Dean Jaensch, Wakefield Press, 1986, pp. 283-291. An expanded version of the first appeared in JHSSA No. 10 (1982), pp. 99-103. The greatest puzzle posed by Linn’s book is that it makes no mention of Playford’s articles. They demonstrated the falsity of the once widespread legend (which Premier Dunstan had tried to reinvigorate in 1973) that political and economic power in South Australia was wielded by a small group that operated from the Club. The Adelaide Club has always been a social club for the promotion of fellowship. Served by outstanding and friendly staff, it continues to preserve some of the ‘gracious living’, as Sir Collier Cudmore had put it, of the latter part of the nineteenth century. There are many other matters that deserved Linn’s notice, but they will probably have to await attention by whomsoever is asked to write the Club’s bicentennial history.

P. A. Howell
Flinders University


People who, like me, grew up in Adelaide in the 1950s, will be drawn to this book. But they need to be aware of what this book is and what it is not. As the editor makes clear, it is neither literature nor history, but an opportunity for ‘people to explore their memories and to share them with others in a readable and engaging way’. I take this to be a warning not to expect great stylistic or analytic achievement. What it offers is something else: a chance for readers to identify with or distinguish themselves from the experiences of the writers, and to discover if the common representation of 1950s Adelaide as dull, conservative, secure, harmonious and stable, with traditional family and religious values intact, stands up to the scrutiny of a disparate group of eye witnesses.

The editor tells us that the writing emerges from the child’s viewpoint, and much of it does. Not surprisingly, however, not all contributors, now in their sixties or seventies, manage to sustain this viewpoint. But this does not matter, since the occasional reflections that betray an adult consciousness are interesting and valuable. So too are the adult reflections of Susan Blackburn, the editor, whose substantial introduction locates the book historiographically, sets the records of individual experiences within broader historical themes, discusses the limitations inherent in the sample, and acknowledges the unreliability of memory as historical evidence.

So what was it like to be growing up in Adelaide in the 1950s? For many it involved new houses in raw, dusty suburbs, with no paved footpaths, little in the way of community amenities, and with unsupervised play happening in backyards, empty blocks and on the streets. An outsider reading these accounts might imagine Adelaide as a somewhat rough and ready place. But descriptions of more developed material environments,
and more settled communities in the older suburbs, demonstrate that that was not the whole picture. Whatever the material environment, there is a pervasive sense that the 1950s was a period of taken-for-granted safety and security. Most of the contributors refer to an absence of what is now known as consumerism and extol the simple pleasures of non-commercial entertainment, such as reading, bike riding, mucking about in creek beds or at the beach or engaging in informal games or more risky high-jinks with other neighbourhood children. They display varying degrees of acceptance of people whom they saw as different from themselves, including recent immigrants. Claire Hayes’ chapter, ‘Our Migrant Neighbours’, stands out as a thoughtful account of a childhood greatly enriched by the ‘New Australians’ who were part of her family’s world. Predictably, many contributors have things to say about school. Martin Caust’s detailed piece is the highlight, but taken together all the accounts paint a highly recognisable picture of the crowded classrooms, the teaching styles, the curriculum priorities of the period. I was disappointed however, to find, amid many recollections of teachers whose names were preceded by ‘Mrs’, a repetition of the fiction that married women were not employed as teachers during the 1950s. They were: they just were not officially regarded as ‘permanent’ and they were not eligible for promotion.

Many of the contributors present their childhood as parochial and debate- and issue-free, and assume that this was the universal experience. Of course it was not, and chapters that challenge this assumption are especially interesting. One is Craig Campbell’s vivid account of growing up in Woodville Gardens. He describes an early awareness of what it meant to be working class and of family patterns that did not conform to conventional ideas of ‘normal’. He knew a world beyond Woodville Gardens and was conscious of, and sometimes frightened by, the Cold War. He gleaned political insights from his father, had opinions about politicians and knew about the ‘Harvester Judgement family’ (p.35). Campbell, like a large proportion of Australian children in the fifties, went to Sunday School. While many other contributors remember this experience mainly for the sporting and social opportunities it afforded, he writes about it in greater depth, acknowledging it as ‘part of the route that would eventually lead to socialist political engagement by the late 1960s’ (p.48). This challenges some of the common stereotypes of Adelaide and of the 1950s.

Another chapter that challenges the stereotypes is Margaret Kartomi’s ‘Growing up in a musical Quaker family’. Within this volume, her story is distinctive. Her parents were ‘free thinkers’ and peace activists, involved in organisations working for social and political reform. From her we learn of a family in which middle class cultural and educational achievement, and gender equality, were highly valued and energetically pursued. She also records the impact in Adelaide of the Colombo Plan, a scheme which gave African and South-East Asian students a tertiary education and some Adelaideans – including her family, and, as it happens, mine – exposure to cultures and cuisines radically different from their own. As Kartomi acknowledges, her childhood was ‘very unusual’ (p.256). What her story tells us is that 1950s Adelaide was not just about the usual.

I noted various factual errors that could have been avoided with more careful editing. The most serious was the claim that ‘there was no gas in Adelaide’ (p.208). There was plenty. The South Australian Gas Company (SAGASCO) was established in 1863, and many Adelaide houses in the 1950s still had SAGASCO stoves rather than the new-fangled electric ones. And who can forget the gasometer that dominated the Brompton skyline?

The book is liberally illustrated with maps from Gregory’s Adelaide Street Directories and with photos that add considerably to the memories evoked by the text.

Judith Raftery  
University of Adelaide

*Out of the Silence: the history and memory of South Australia’s frontier wars* is a nationally important book for what it reveals about the violent history of South Australian settlement and the complex processes that have made frontier warfare between settlers and Indigenous nations invisible in South Australian histories. As such, Robert Foster and Amanda Nettelbeck make a valuable South Australian contribution to the ongoing national debate about frontier violence and the broader Australian ‘History Wars’.1 They also contribute to the international conversation about history and national identity within Pacific Rim settler states such as the United States, Canada and New Zealand.

South Australia is often characterised as an example of peaceful British settlement founded on King William IV’s enlightened promises to Indigenous people contained in the South Australian Letters Patent. Foster and Nettelbeck trace the history of this positive characterisation of South Australia’s treatment of Indigenous people and the selective privileging of this original promise. By contrast, *Out of the Silence* presents a traumatic account of the violence experienced by the ancestors of contemporary Indigenous people. The authors use measured, dispassionate language to develop accounts of violent events and the responses and discussions of the colonial authorities. Often the language of the earlier colonial period inflects the style of the history itself. This discursive style reinforces the identity of the authors as non-Indigenous historians constructing a history, although shocking, seemingly distant and disconnected from contemporary South Australians.

In focussing on violent frontier warfare Foster and Nettelbeck define the frontier as something temporally associated with the early colonial period. This approach gives the impression that the violence of settlement is complete and that Indigenous resistance ended a long time ago. They treat the securing of control by the British settlers and colonial authorities as having been achieved. This makes it difficult for readers to imagine that the process of colonisation continues, that Indigenous people continue to experience violent invasion, continue to resist and are seeking a just settlement today. This kind of historical disjunction and political positioning can weaken programs and processes directed at reconciliation in Australia. Indigenous histories, experiences and projects are disconnected from the ‘History Wars’ debate through this kind of history.

When reading *Out of the Silence* it is important to think about the kinds of objectives that the authors have for their project. Are they attempting to provide a systematic glimpse into the violence of the South Australian frontier through the white, archival sources of the era? Is this strategy an attempt to put South Australia on the ‘History Wars’ map, ensuring that past myths of peaceful settlement are not retold and reinvigorated in popular debates about Australian national identity? What is the text’s broader contribution to national and international debates around colonialism, national histories and comparative histories of policing in the early ‘frontiers’ of Pacific Rim settler-nations? *Out of the Silence* will undoubtedly inform the reader’s response to contemporary political, legal, cultural and social issues such as reconciliation, national identity, native title and Indigenous disadvantage.

For the South Australian reader this is difficult terrain. I would recommend that *Out of the Silence* be read alongside texts such as *Survival in Our Own Land: Aboriginal experiences in South Australia since 1836*, *Outback Ghettoes: a history of Aboriginal institutionalisation and survival* and *Coming to Terms: Aboriginal title in South Australia*.2 Armed with a new understanding of South Australian history readers will be able to make sense of strong words such as the following.
from Ngarrindjeri leaders George Trevorrow, Thomas Trevorrow and Mathew Rigney (all recently deceased) that bear witness to the ongoing nature of the ‘frontier wars’ as experienced by Indigenous people in South Australia. They raise the promises contained in the Letters Patent and the continuing pursuit of a just settlement and some form of treaty.

Our Old People, our Elders, and our families have been subjected to oppressive laws for a long time. These laws have denied our Elders equal human status; they have taken our land; they have imprisoned some of us on Reserves and Missions; they have placed us in gaols; they have wrecked our communities and our economy. For all of us we need to understand why the laws have failed to protect our rights to land. It makes no sense to us why our native rights to our lands and waters were protected in the Letters Patent but not in reality.3


Steve Hemming
Flinders University


Don Loffler is well known in motoring circles as an authority on the history of Holden motor vehicles. Holden Days is his fifth book on the subject, and in it Loffler shares some of the history of the first ten Holden models, beginning with the original 48-215 (released in 1948 and often referred to as the FX) through to the HR, released in 1966.

Loffler has an amazing technical knowledge of Holdens, but this book is much more than a technical history. Loffler is also a great story teller, and through the pages of Holden Days he shares some of his own memories of his family’s Holden ownership. He has also encouraged others to share both their photographs and their memories. Indeed, leafing through Holden Days the reader is able to glance into the family photo albums of many Australian families, and there are some lovely social history documents amongst them, including some terrific shots of Holdens decked out to celebrate the 1953 coronation of Queen Elizabeth II and her subsequent visit to Australia.

Loffler’s account of each of the ten models includes examples of advertising material produced by GMH along with a summary of the key changes in styling and engineering. He also provides information about how the vehicle was received by the market and stories relating to that particular model.

As well as Loffler’s overview of each of the models described in the book, there is also a collection of affectionate stories documenting adventures and daily life in Holdens written by others or reproduced as told to Loffler. One memorable story was recalled by Kevin Adler, who had been driving back from a wedding in the Barossa Valley one night in 1965 in an EK Special. Suddenly they were confronted by two sets of headlights on the road ahead – a car trying to overtake a truck. Inevitably, an accident occurred. Thankfully none of the three in Kevin’s car was seriously injured – particularly as they were not wearing seat belts, but Kevin was thrown through the windscreen: a reminder of how far safety features on new cars have come. Another of my favourite stories from the book also relates to seat belts, and it is told in photos: in 1966, GMH was endeavouring to promote the fact that seat belts were included as part of a safety upgrade. A media event designed to demonstrate how strong the seat belts were was held. An HR Special was suspended from a crane by seat belts while carrying the weight of a Vauxhall Viva below it. All it took was one jerk of the crane and the lot came crashing down in a spectacular fashion, but we can still...
marvel that the seat belt was able to hold the weight in the first place.

The launch of the 48-215 in 1948 was a milestone in Australian motoring history, and well-publicised as ‘Australia’s own car’. The photographs reproduced in Holden Days show crowds of people gathered around showrooms to see for themselves what the new Holden looked like. While that level of interest may not have been replicated since, Loffler’s book demonstrates that the brand developed a strong and loyal following, and has a well deserved place in Australian history.

Allison Russell, History SA

Books received

Brian Carr and Dennis Hardy, *Roseworthy: a new garden town*, Light Regional Council, Kapunda, 2013, pp. 149, rrp. $22.98.


